Meeting Questions & Comments (pp 1-9)

In-person/Online	Question from June 26 Meeting	Response	Topic
Online	Are there images from the street side/wall of the streets along River Terrace? Will the artwork at the intersection need to be removed at Warren/River Terrace? Is so, why?	Images and views of River Terrace can be found in presentation materials from the June 26th North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project public meeting. Additional images will be prepared by the design team as the design continues to evolve. It is not anticipated that the public art at River Terrace and Warren Street will be impacted. Meeting materials can be found under the 'COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT VIDEOS & PRESENTATIONS' tile on the dedicated project website here: https://bpca.ny.gov/nwbpcr/.	
Online	The wall you are proposing in HRP will not stop an event so that should not be the goal. There are plantings close to this wall - what about FEMA required buffer areas?	The final North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project design will meet FEMA requirements, including all planting restrictions (which only preclude woody vegetation).	Barrier Systems
In-Person	First question, is there a budget? And then there's a second part. That's why I'm asking that question. Is there a budget? Doing the study that I've done going out 15 years, we're going to be looking at $10 a square foot. We've already lost the garage because they couldn't afford to pay the PILOT and the city taxes. So when you have two billion dollars already on the homes' land; right? That's about how much has been borrowed. So if you're going to borrow X amount more money, and now we go to $10 a square foot, a one-bedroom apartment to walk into is going to be about $3800 a month in charges. So then we start having empty apartments and we're trying to get the land lease lower, it sounds to me like we're hoping it's not going to be raised. But bringing up what I just brought in brought up, it doesn't seem possible to lower it, and it only seems possible to go up because if you take the bonds as you roll them every three to five years, we're not looking at three percent. We're going to be looking at six, seven, eight percent. So and I did the study that you sent out and it doesn't take into account any of that.	As we are still in the early phases of design, a full Project budget has not yet been established. However, based on other coastal resiliency projects citywide, as well as other available information, the Authority has a rough sense of the overall project costs and, as a result, a $1 billion increase in its bonding capacity was included in last year's State budget. Along with their cost proposal for the Project's design services, the Progressive Design Build team included a rough order of magnitude cost estimate for construction, excluding a number of significant cost drivers that were yet to be determined. That estimate, of approximately $595 million, did not include interior drainage, utility and temporary art work relocation, easements, design fees and other indirect project costs, projected escalations, and other expenses. Including those other factors, we expect that the Project's cost will exceed $1 billion. However, the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project is a Progressive Design-Build (PDB) project, which means that both design and construction services will be performed by the same team under one contract. Generally, Design-Build projects have proven to reduce cost and schedule overruns over the life of the project, and so we are confident that the Project's established budget will be reliable once it is established. The Authority's debt load does not in any way determine PILOT (which is set entirely set by the City of New York) or ground rent, which is the result of competitively-bid contracts with each individual building in Battery Park City.	Budget
In-person	Can we save the BCPA money by offering more seats to community members? This might limit the amount of the bond offering.	The composition of the BPCA Board, which currently includes two Battery Park City residents (one of whom is the Acting Chair) and a third, Financial District resident, has no bearing on the cost of the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project.	Budget
In-Person	Just going back to the budget question. Just curious how you design and plan a project without a budget? I'm less familiar with that. It seems to me that if this is fully designed and planned, we're going to be budget takers versus setting a budget. So paying for whatever cost it ends up being. And I guess a follow-up to that would be, like a lot of projects, budgets end up costing a lot more than expected, especially large, complex projects such as this one. So what happens if it ends up costing two or three times what we planned on it costing? Where's the escape valve? Does that fully fall on the residents? Who's taking that risk? Does the city at some point step in? Do you not complete parts of the project because you've run out of money? How do you guys think about that? How do you plan for these contingencies?	We have great confidence that in working with our progressive design build partners and with the Authority's own financing plan that we will be in a position to complete this project with certainty as to cost. And we see no reason to expect that there would be any kind of overrun to the magnitude that you're alluding to nor any reason for any state or city entity to step in to somehow complete portions of the project that we were not able to. It is also important to note that, indirectly, the City of New York is paying for Battery Park City's resiliency projects. The City allows BPCA to keep some of the monies BPCA collects on the City's behalf, in the form of ground rent and PILOT, to stay in Battery Park City each year to be spent on maintaining the neighborhood and conducting capital projects, such as the Authority's resiliency initiatives as part of the overall Lower Manhattan Coastal Resiliency Project. Without BPCA, 100% of the ground rent and PILOT collected from Battery Park City residents would go straight to the City of New York to be spent across the five boroughs.	Budget
In-Person	Two-part question, but both on a related subject. First, as you pointed in the first Reach out into Tribeca, it looks like the property that will additionally benefit beyond Battery Park City is worth a couple hundred million dollars. I sense that's the case in the South also, as it extends into FiDi. Is there any discussion about having those property owners or the city on their behalf, even though it's not the intent to protect them, you have to do it to protect Battery Park City, they will nonetheless be protected. Is there any discussion of having them participate in the cost of this? And to follow on the previous point, the bond issue is reliant on current income from ground rent plus; I'm sorry, PILOT and ground rent plus increases that are already built into those existing agreements. Committing all of that previously uncommitted money will necessarily prejudice your ability to possibly reduce ground rent; is that correct?	No, not all of that money is necessary to cover the debt service. There still is a very significant amount of excess revenue that would flow to the City. It is also important to note that, indirectly, the City of New York *is paying* for Battery Park City's resiliency projects. The City allows BPCA to keep some of the monies BPCA collects on the City's behalf, in the form of ground rent and PILOT, to stay in Battery Park City each year to be spent on maintaining the neighborhood and conducting capital projects, such as the Authority's resiliency initiatives as part of the overall Lower Manhattan Coastal Resiliency Project. Without BPCA, 100% of the ground rent and PILOT collected from Battery Park City residents would go straight to the City of New York to be spent across the five boroughs. The Authority's debt load does not in any way determine PILOT (which is set entirely set by the City of New York) or ground rent, which is the result of competitively-bid contracts with each individual building in Battery Park City. Therefore, not issuing these bonds would simply mean that more money is passed from the Authority to the City of New York, rather than being spent in Battery Park City to protect Battery Park City and Lower Manhattan.	Budget; Interagency Coordination
In-Person	Thank you. I have a comment and a quick question, but I'll fit it in two minutes. The pictures like this with us on the inside of the wall, this is just a 3-foot wall. But some of them, in some places it's 9 feet, in some places it's 10 feet. The people seem unnaturally tall. And I don't really mean, like, relative to myself. But in general I don't feel like it's a fair perspective of how we'll feel on this side of the wall looking out. And my second is a question following up on cost. Rockefeller Park, the playground was completed only last year. It was out of commission for two years. It was a lot of money. This has been in the works while that was happening. Was there any coordination between you guys? And how much exactly have we spent at this 30 percent mark; any rough estimate?	All the renderings here, we didn't deliberately tried to choose tall people. Hopefully what the presentation conveys is where the wall is high, like in Reach 1, the design team is doing our best to make that experience better. Fly-through visuals and renderings will continue to be updated as the project's designs are updated. The refurbished Rockefeller Park Playground re-opened in October 2020, the fourth and final playground repair project BPCA completed in 2019-2020 (read more: https://bpca.ny.gov/bpc-people/rockefeller-park-playground-re-opened/). At that time the BPCA had begun with the community preliminary design discussion about the North Battery Park City Resiliency Project, which would not have impacted the Rockefeller Park Playground. Since then, BPCA has been granted Progressive Design Build* authority by the New York State Legislature, and has subsequently combined the North Battery Park City Resiliency Project and planned West Battery Park City Resiliency Project into the combined North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project (NWBPCR). By time the Rockefeller Park Playground is impacted by NWBPCR (construction currently scheduled to being in 2025), the Battery Park City community will have enjoyed the refurbished playground for roughly five years. ** A Progressive Design-Build project means that both design and construction services are performed by the same team under one contract. Generally, Design-Build projects have proven to reduce cost and schedule overruns over the life of the project. Progressive Design-Build in particular is a project delivery method that provides for the owner – in this case BPCA – to retain control over the design process for longer than typical Design Build projects.	Budget; Public Engagement
In-Person	I have two questions. They're both kind of quality-of-life questions. And the first is, I use the bike path all the time and the bike path is extremely dangerous now. There are motor scooters that come on it. There are delivery people with huge bikes. There are E-scooters, E-bikes. No one supervises that bike path. There are no tickets given. Nobody has ever stopped. With that wall there it looks like the material, as you said, it has to be very durable and strong. That seems to be a danger or a red flag for me that with all the conditions we have now, now we're going to have a wall with it where there's going to be people speeding by and maybe crashing into the wall. So I would urge you to take consideration of the fact that the laws are not enforced on the bike path. And there are electric vehicles all over the bike path all the way up. I ride it all the time. The other thing is, with the graffiti on the wall, I mean, it's it looks very beautiful in the renderings, but in reality, is there going to be something that covers it to prevent people tagging it or people even posting, you know, signs advertising?	BPCA will continue its coordination with its partners at the NYPD 1st Precinct on quality- of-life matters such as e-scooter and e-bike use on crowded pedestrian paths. Battery Park City's Neighborhood Coordination Officers can also be reached as follows: <u>BPC below West Thames Street</u> PO Serge Jean SERGE.JEAN@nypd.org PO Frank Jilling FRANK.JILLING@nypd.org <u>BPC above West Thames Street</u> PO Thomas Nethaway THOMAS.NETHAWAY@nypd.org PO Eugene Uske EUGENE.USKE@nypd.org Battery Park City is patrolled on a 24x7x365 basis by its Allied Universal security team, which regularly notes graffiti and other conditions in need of cleanup or repair. For the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project specifically, the project team is currently researching the best coatings that we can use, what's the best surfaces that we can use. We want a surface that's robust from graffiti, but we also want a surface that is cleanable and looks nice and presentable. The Authority's landscape has a high design aesthetic, and what we want to do is match the historic nature of that aesthetic with something's that able to withstand graffiti or tampering or anything else that might be an unintended use.	Circulation; Public Realm

Online	Has there been any consideration to what climate mitigation (not just adaptation) strategies can be included in this plan?	The purpose of the project is to protect from a storm. When we think about the storm mathematically, the storm is really two things: It's rain and surge. And so what we've done is, we've designed the project to achieve what we call the joint probability of both a surge event and a heavy rain. Because what we don't want to do is build a project that has a wall but can be flooded like a bathtub. At the same time, we also don't want the inverse to take place. So we've looked at 10 or 15 different types of combinations of rain and surge occurring, and we've chosen the worst case, and that's our design case. So the project has looked at different intensities of rainfall that are beyond what DEP is requiring right now. The industry is trying to define what we mean by extreme rainfall. But we've certainly looked at more intense rainfalls -- or what might be called a cloud burst -- events that occur over 24 hours and the project defends against that. We've talked about surge and climate change, and the project incorporates that. We've also talked about opportunities within the project to recognize that there are certain places within the project where summertime heat is significant. And maybe the project gives us an opportunity to address that somehow. We've talked about adaptability of the ecosystem, of the plantings in the Authority's property, as over time, whatever is growing in the Authority's property is going to be subject to an increasing level of salinity because of the effects of climate change. So all of these things represent adaptive approaches that the project is taking.	Climate Change
In-Person	I wanted to understand when you think the construction will start? And just to clarify, I think you just answered it, but are you saying that you're not sure yet if it's going to happen all at once or if it's going to be in phases, so we'll keep access to the park?	Construction on the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project is expected to begin in 2025. Between now and then, the project team will proceed through all the different design milestones, and obtain our important and very significant federal and state permits (and proceed through the permitting process that's associated with those permits). While it is premature to speculate on the phasing, what we're doing as a project team is presenting the 30%, which is our way of capturing the feedback that we've received over the past nine months from stakeholders, residents, and agencies. Validating that 30 %, getting more feedback on that, and then pushing into different and deeper levels, of design. As we go along that process, the construction phasing, identifying the types of equipment, and the staging areas, all that's going to become clearer. And then when we have a clear answer on that, we will share that with you. We just don't have the complete answer to the question, but we safely say we're not doing all the project at once. We can also say pretty safely it won't be one reach at a time. So it'll be something in between. And we'll formulating a strategy for, coming back and talking to the community about that so you have an opportunity to understand that more and provide us with your thoughts about that.	Construction
In-person	When do you estimate construction will begin? Will it be done in phases, or will we lose access to the entire park at once?	Construction phasing and staging plans will be part of the ongoing dialogue with the community as design progresses throughout 2023 and into early 2024. Though construction will require partial and/or full closures of certain public spaces in Battery Park City for specific periods during construction, we will endeavor to limit these closures to the extent feasible and will communicate those impacts promptly and clearly, in advance of the closures.	Construction
Online	Are there any vulnerabilities with the ConEd substation at 7 WTC as it is on a lower elevation (9A) and provides power to Lower Manhattan and was at risk during Sandy?	The designed flood barrier system will have the advantage of providing additional protection for area inland of BPC including West Street / Route 9A.	Construction
Online	How is BCPA going to accommodate and compensate people with respiratory health issues while construction is outside our apartments?	As the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project moves into later phases of the design we'll have greater clarity about how we're going to construct it, how we're going to phase it, and how we're going to schedule it. Part of the conversation is making sure that the equipment that we use, the phasing that we've chosen, how we're constructing, is minimizing noise, dust, and any impacts to the people who are experiencing this construction. So we're going to use best practices to minimize dust and noise. We're going to follow all city laws and city ordinances to minimize dust and noise. And we're going to do everything that we can so that we don't have those types of impacts experienced by people who surround the construction. But I think that that conversation is going to happen in subsequent meetings as we have greater finalization on what we're designing, and we begin to talk more about constructing and phasing.	Construction
Online	Will construction on the reaches occur sequentially or in parallel? In which order is sequentially?	Construction phasing and impacts are currently being studied and identified by the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team.	Construction
Online	Is there any visibility into the timeline of the construction of each individual stretch, and how it aligns with the construction in Wagner and the Battery? In other words, is the entirety of downtown going to be under construction at once?	Construction phasing and staging plans will be part of the ongoing dialogue with the community as design progresses throughout 2023 and into early 2024. Though construction will require partial and/or full closures of certain public spaces in Battery Park City for specific periods during construction, we will endeavor to limit these closures to the extent feasible and will communicate those impacts promptly and clearly, in advance of the closures.	Construction
Online	How many reaches will be worked on at one time? That is, will the entire area be an ongoing construction site?	Construction phasing and staging plans will be part of the ongoing dialogue with the community as design progresses throughout 2023 and into early 2024. Though construction will require partial and/or full closures of certain public spaces in Battery Park City for specific periods during construction, we will endeavor to limit these closures to the extent feasible and will communicate those impacts promptly and clearly, in advance of the closures.	Construction
Online	In Rockefeller Park, why isn't there any change in the before and after photos?	The proposed changes in the Rockefeller Park lawn area will be minor and meant to address existing drainage issues. Impact to the existing conditions around the lawn will be minimal.	Construction
Online	How does this proposed work intersect with the proposed work further north along the West Side Highway (The project in the NYT editorial with the awful obstruction of the river)?	When we were talking to the city of Long Beach about the (U.S. Army Corps of Engineers NY & NJ Harbor & Tributaries) "HATS" study, we were reminded of the HATS study that was done in 1970 that had the same alignments and proposed barriers around the same area in New York Harbor. So the problem with such a type of system is that you have to build all of it and then once it's constructed it would protect from surge -- this is true. But it wouldn't protect from climate change. It wouldn't have an impact for the extreme rainfall. It wouldn't have an impact with daily tidal cycles and daily tidal flooding. And so the City of New York has made a decision that Lower Manhattan is protected by a series of projects that are intervening now because the City believes that that's the best approach. There's a lot of technical discussion about the harbor-wide approach. Arcadis was the designer for the areas around Jamaica Bay and Coney Island, and gave the U.S. Army Corps its cost estimates. Arcadis also designed those gates in Rotterdam. So they are valid opinions in both ways, but at this point today, the City of New York, over the past decade, has come up with a policy that says we're going to protect Lower Manhattan sooner in a more real way from a funded perspective with interventions along the shore.	Construction, Timeline
Online	How will the work progress from North to South or South to North? How long will it take to complete? When is the anticipated start?	Construction phasing and staging plans will be part of the ongoing dialogue with the community as design progresses throughout 2023 and into early 2024. Though construction will require partial and/or full closures of certain public spaces in Battery Park City for specific periods during construction, we will endeavor to limit these closures to the extent feasible and will communicate those impacts promptly and clearly, in advance of the closures.	Construction/Timeline
In-person	What is the construction schedule for the project? Will all the Reaches be constructed simultaneously or will it be sequential? When will construction start in 2025? Is all of the funding money in place?	Construction phasing and impacts are currently being studied and identified by the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team. The funding is in place.	Construction; Budget
In-Person	I guess to start out, thank you for having the consideration of not moving the ferry terminal while the construction is going on. I really appreciate that, because that was a big issue. And I hope that that can be accomplished, and whatever we can do to work with you to make that happen. But I've got a question about where the you called the Lily Pond, I call it the pond. I don't understand, just because it went so quickly. You said you're going to preserve it. Would you just go a little more slowly about where the alignment is and where it's going to be? Sorry; all the way back. Yeah, that one. Yeah.	The Irish Hunger Memorial is right near by Lily Pond, so in order to preserve the Lily Pond we will be constructing the flood wall between it and Irish Hunger Memorial Plaza. So this construction will have to close the Lily Pond, but it will remain as is. And then the alignment will continue along 300 Vesey Street here and to the south, roughly bisecting the current Esplanade. [**View relevant presentation slide here:** https://media.bpca.ny.gov/wp-content/uploads/2023/06/27002552/NWBPCR-Project-Community-Meeting-June-26-2023.pdf#page=54]	Construction; Ferry Terminal; Lily Pond
Online	What exactly will this wall do? How long will it take to build and what toxic exposure will happen when you build it? How much noise will it make? Will residents get notice for the noisiest and most toxic days?	We won't know how long it will take to finalize the design of the wall, and really won't have a precise estimate of how long it would take to construct, until we have a final design (The project design is currenlty at roughly 30%.) As the design progresses and these answers become knowable, the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team will provide more information on construction staging and phasing.	Construction; Public Engagement
In-Person	I'm a local resident. Realizing that this is still in early planning days, do you have any sense of which phases will be constructed after which one, and just rough timing? It looked like the anticipated start date is fall of 2025. Would you be moving from 1 to 9 or from south coming north? Thank you.	The Authority is looking at different alternatives right now. We don't have a firm answer for that. But as soon as we have that clear answer, we're going to come back and that will be presented in community forums regarding phasing and construction scheduling. There's a lot of different choices that we can make and we're evaluating those choices right now.	Construction; Timeline

Online	I live in Reach 6, in Gateway Plaza on the first floor in Building 300. The wall you are proposing, where one already exists, is about 10' from my windows - 4 large windows. While I'm concerned about losing the view of the river to a wall, we're also concerned about the construction process. The noise, the dirt into our apartment and the overall disruption and loss of privacy while it continues. How do you plan to address tenants concerns such as this?	We anticipate the wall height of the flood barrier system (FBS) being approximately the height of the existing wall, so your view will not be impacted. Until the final design we won't cannot speak to construction process or duration. Hours of operation and dust management will come into focus as we finalize the design.	Construction; Views; Public Engagement
Online	Has there been any research and consideration in implementing the vertical barriers into the ocean (or deep rivers) to deflect a tsunami before catastrophic waves build to the coast? Anything within the water - Wouldn't that lower the danger of waves?	A tsunami is a drastically different condition where a wave travels a very long distance to shore, versus the design intent for hurricane or tropical cyclones where wind forms waves much closer to shore.	Deployable Flood Wall
In person	Can you talk about the drainage systems that will be used for the spaces between the river and the retaining walls? Will there be cisterns used as was done in the new playground in the Battery?	The space between the flood walls and river will continue to drain as they normally do, with some alterations as needed to increase level of service or isolate stormwater from the protected area	Drainage
Online	The question of how a wall addresses drainage of increased rainfall wasn't addressed just that it's been considered. A wall can keep water out. Can you please explain how it allows NYC streets to drain (as limited at by teardrop standing water question as well)?	The existing drainage system will be isolated along the wall to prevent storm surge from entering the protected area through existing sewers. Where the wall changes existing drainage patterns, new drainage infrastructure will be incorporated to allow water to drain at low points. Additional mitigation solutions, such as a pump station, are being examined to manage stormwater during coastal storm events when existing outfalls are submerged.	Drainage Systems
In-person	About drainage (as opposed to cisterns) in Rockefeller Park - be aware that the area can not drain back into the Hudson River until water levels recede. Pooling will occur and remain until water level recedes. Is this a necessary trade-off of allowing Rockefeller Park to flood? Also, will there be a backstop in the drains to prevent water from flowing IN them? Also, when you say you are building to be adaptable, like strong/wide foundations, please confirm what that means... Can the wall height be increased without major construction, for example?	Areas on the water side of the barrier will continue to drain by gravity to Hudson River, as they currently do in Rockefeller Park. The barrier is not intended to have a negative impact on drainage in Rockefeller Park but additional drainage improvements are being explored in Rockefeller Park to improve drainage during rainfall events. Where the barrier crosses existing drainage infrastructure, sewers will be isolated or backflow prevention will be added to prevent water from entering the protected area through the sewer system. Regarding adaptability, yes -- the barrier's fooundation is intended to be designed to allow for future height adjustments without major construction.	Drainage Systems; Flood Barrier System
In-Person	Can you talk about the drainage systems that will be needed for the spaces between the river and the retaining walls? Will there be cisterns used as was done in the new playground in the Battery?	For the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project the wall is, relatively speaking, following the coastline. Rockefeller Park might be the one place where there's a big departure between where the water is right now and where our wall is. Our approach to drainage and Rockefeller Park is a minimalist approach to address the current ponding that's there right now. But for the most part, there's not a lot of distance between the wall and the edge of the water where the Hudson is. And so besides drainage systems that are necessary to be placed around the particular systems or barriers that we install, we don't plan to have any significant drainage outside of the wall alignment and we will not have any cisterns either.	Draining Systems
Online	What is being considered in emergency maritime egress from areas within the BPCA catchment that are not North Cove?	Emergency maritime egress should not be impacted by the proposed flood barrier system because maritime egress is not a viable option during a storm surge when the gates would be closed.	Emergencies
Online	Why can't we move the ferry terminal South and stay South?	In order to minimize project costs, permit restrictions, and construction delays, the ferry terminal will not be moved for this project. More technically speaking, moving the ferry terminal south would interfere with intake structures for the cooling of the Brookfield Complex. There are large pipes that draw water in for the cooling system, and moving the terminal south would impact the ability of those intakes to suck in the quality of water necessary for thier cooling system.	Ferry Terminal
In-Person	When you were talking about the wall that will run through Hudson River Park on the highway, you said it was going that wall wasn't there to be for the streets west in Tribeca. But what is that why you're building the wall; to protect Tribeca? Or are you building that wall to protect Battery Park City?	The project area is being built because it's necessary to protect Battery Park City. If we were able to protect Battery Park City, achieve risk reduction for Battery Park City, without extending northward and across Route 9A to Tribeca, we would do that. We cannot do that. We have to connect to the high point that Peter pointed out at Greenwich and North Moore in order to achieve the level of protection necessary for Battery Park City. That provides the additional benefit of protecting a broader area beyond Battery Park City and in the area that Peter just pointed out. But the primary reason that we are building in that area is that it's necessary for protection of Battery Park City.	Flood Barrier System
Online	This must be refined at North Moore and Greenwich. Greenwich Street was originally water at Greenwich and North Moore.	Thank you for your input, the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team continues to refine the design around the area of the Greenwich and North Moore.	Flood Barrier System
In-Person	What is a moving wall?	We generally call them deployables. When you have a wall, there are certain parts where you want to create a gap so that people can walk through it. And what we're saying now is there's different ways to close that gap; right? That gap will exist when we go out there on a sunny day, everyone's going to see the gap. However, when the storm is coming up, and it's off the coast of North Carolina, or when it's in the Mid-Atlantic, we're going to have a plan that says, as that storm approaches and comes up the East Coast, we're going to progressively close those gaps. And there's different ways to close those gaps: sometimes we slide a door in front of it; sometimes the door comes from ground; and sometimes we insert something from the bottom. And all those different choices have different maintenance impacts, and they have slightly different protection performance. So the design team is trying to figure out right now which of the specific deployables we're going to put in all of these gaps, so that the product performs as we need it to d during the storm, but is also maintainable and looks good.	Flood Barrier System
In-Person	Does the number of deployables or the footage of deployables affect the failure rate of the wall?	If the wall had no deployables and was a complete straight shot, the wall would be easier to operate because it wouldn't require someone to intervene. However, like I said before, we're trying to balance the wall, the robustness of the wall, and the experience of the public around the wall. And so in certain areas we have to leave these gaps to promote egress. And so we've worked hard to minimize the amount of gaps. And we've worked hard to put closures on those gaps that are simple to operate and maintainable and robust, and are as strong as the wall itself. So the project strikes that balance between permeability during non-storm conditions and robustness when the design storm would occur. But I can talk -- we can, you know, talk more about that specifically afterwards because there's a lot of discussion and there's a lot of specifics technically on that issue.	Flood Barrier System
In-Person	I just want to clarify that you're going to have the cisterns in Rockefeller Park, because that's going to flood, right?	To clarify: The word cistern suggests storage. We are not planning on storing the water. What we're planning on doing -- and again, we're still designing this so we don't have this finalized -- is we're considering whether if we put additional drainage that shunts the collected water the ponding that exists after the rain event occurs. But we don't currently plan to have any storage because that would represent a larger construction project that we do now.	Flood Barrier System
Online	Is it possible to put deployables/wall on Liberty Street and allow Pumphouse Park to flood if a storm comes?	The design team isn't contemplating flooding Pumphouse Park. We are still in the process of looking at a broad array of alternatives for the Pumphouse Park area because we recognize the constraint between Pumphouse Park and the edge of the North Cove Marina. So we'll take that suggestion back, but right now within the team, the dialogue isn't to have Pumphouse Park flood. We're looking to see what we can do to make the existing built form work.	Flood Barrier System
Online	In places where the wall can be raised alongside the existing line (South portion), why consider major design changes alongside the existing path? I.e., considering how much "extra" disruption (and cost) would be required by making design changes versus just putting the wall up.	The flood protection system is being built up against an existing set of private properties, so there's no construction staging that can occur landside of the wall. All of the construction equipment is going to be moving in this area where the existing upper pathway and garden areas are. So our limit of work -- basically the area that will be disrupted by the construction itself -- is the area that you see here in green [**watch accompanying video segment here:** https://youtu.be/hDHbRtLrwQQ?t=10247]. So we need to put something back. As we've been looking at what we can put back, we've been looking at ways that we can optimize and -- planting beds that we can -- a lot of the trees here are actually encumbered in their root zones. So we're looking at ways that we can, sort of, increase the amount of planted area that they have; provide as much shade as possible and create welcoming, sort of, areas at the end of the streets. So these are all the things that have been going into our thinking as we've been looking at redesigning the area. If there are thoughts on how to put the area back, I think we're very open to those. But I want to be very clear about the cost question because this is an area which will need to be reconstructed in any case.	Flood Barrier System
Online	How can you integrate back and arm rests on the multiple walls that you show with people sitting on them? Also they look like they are inviting to skateboards.	The team acknowledges this comment and will explore design opportunities for comfortable seating as well as companion seating, and strategies to minimize unintended uses.	Flood Barrier System
Online	Why weren't offshore deployables considered?	While there is a place for offshore elements -- Arcadis and SCAPE, two of the firms involved in the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project, designed the Living Breakwaters Project off Staten Island -- they don't technically meet the criteria that this project is looking to acheive. Wetlands, for example, might slow down a wave that might be at the height of the wetland. But if the wave is 6-7 feet higher than the wetland, it's not going to slow down the energy. It's not going to slow down the wave action. And so we haven't included them as part of the NWBPCR Project. That sets aside, of course, the ability for us to permit such projects, to demonstrate the effectiveness of those projects, and whether the significant costs of those projects would have the benefit.	Flood Barrier System
Online	Is there an alternative to extending the platform near Stuyvesant for protection?	An alternative is to raise the platform without extending it further offshore.	Flood Barrier System

In-person	Building a wall around BPC doesn't seem like a 21st century solution. Why can't offshore barrier systems be used instead (in a similar way that was done in the Netherlands)? Could it be because AECOM doesn't have the expertise building offshore barrier systems?	An offshore flood barrier system could minimize disruption to the use of Battery Park City's public spaces, but comes with three major disadvantages: First, an offshore alignment would be much taller (several feet) because wave action is much higher offshore. Second, environmental regulations and shipping lane restrictions would make an offshore system difficult to permit. Third, offshore construction costs would be much higher than the current proposed system.	Flood Barrier System
Online	Was there any alignment for the North end of the project that goes directly across Route 9a from BPC handling BMCC up to and around N. Moore street to Greenwich to provide flood risk reduction without having any impact on Hudson River Park, its Estuarine sanctuary and/or the bike path?	Yes, such an alignment is still in consideration.	Flood Barrier System
In-person	When is the point to discuss how the wall looks? Is there a way to make the wall look natural (like the wall in tear drop parks)?	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is studying different approaches to wall materiality and treatment. These options will be shared with the public for input and feedback at a future community meeting.	Flood Barrier System
Online	On Reach 4, why is there not an option to have the alignment go east of the Irish Hunger Memorial? Please discuss the option of partial deployables in Reach 3 & 4.	Routing the flood barrier system east of the Irish Hunger Memorial would create the need for additional gates, add length to the system, and remove additional space from the protected side of the system.	Flood Barrier System
Online	For reach 3/4, can you talk about the alternative alignment that was submitted to move the alignment further inland to reduce impact? Can you talk about the partially deployable wall in reach 3&4?	This alignment was studied by the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team and referenced in documents shared publicly during the public meeting on June 26, 2023.	Flood Barrier System
In-person	For the client/authority: you mentioned moving as fast as possible. Given any possibility of harbor entrance protection, and public interest such as the June 15 NYT op-ed, should planning and construction consider this?	The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) NY&NJ Harbor & Tributaries Study (HATS) is still ongoing. No design for a USACE-sponsored project based on the HATS study has been selected, nor has funding been secured. In a November 2022 public presentation, the 3B option ($35.6B and 14 years to construct) was proposed by USACE and is expected to act in concert with existing flood barrier systems already constructed or in progress in Manhattan by the City of New York and BPCA, including NWBPCR. The BPCA projects would not be made redundant by this scenario and are, in fact, specifically contemplated by the 3B option.	Flood Barrier System
Online	For the next, possibly more destructive, hurricane, will the barrier system be able to withstand a strong wave of North-bound storm-driven storm surge? Will the system be able to withstand the reflected wave of South-bound surge that will follow?	Coastal modeling for the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project includes wind-driven waves from all directions.	Flood Barrier System
Online	How is the wall adaptable? Present photos make it appear that raising it will require demolition and reconstruction. How are these preliminary designs applicable?	There are methods of constructing additional height to a floodwall without demolition as long as the foundation is designed for additional loading. The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team understands that there has to be an adaptable approach to that Rockefeller area because over time that area will be exposed to climate change and extreme rain and cloud bursts and all the other elements that are going to unfold in the future.	Flood Barrier System
Online	Can you speak to the timeline to activate the deployable solutions? Who decides to activate and how long does it take to implement? How long to remove? Lastly, how is this cost component funded?	The answers to these questions will be detailed in an Emergency Response Plan that is required by FEMA before the flood barrier system can be accredited. The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project is slated to be funded through a bond issue.	Flood Barrier System; Budget
In-Person	I am the president of the Battery Park City Homeowners Coalition. More than 5,000 homeowners who, with their ground rents and their taxes, are going to pay for this. So we want to watch this very carefully. One thing we saw, this meandering in the South Esplanade. The inner walkway on the South Esplanade is fine; it works fine. It's more than 15 feet from where you're going to put the privacy wall. You don't have to touch it. You don't have to do anything with it. A couple of times we asked about this no one came up with this bicycle problem. People came up with just, well, it would be a nice thing to do to create a meandering walk through the forest. We need flood protection. We need flood protection, with good taste, which is why we're doing it through you guys, not through the Corps of Engineers. But we don't need nice touches that are going to add hundreds of thousands of dollars to this project. So that inner walkway runs nice and straight. People can get back and forth and that with baby carriages. People can back and forth with walkers. To meander it is not going to curb bicycle use. It's going to just make it more dangerous because of blind turns, and it's just a pointless waste of money that adds no flood protection. And take that as an example and go through the whole project and look where you can knock off $100,000 here, $100,000 there. Because we're going to pay for it.	Two answers here: One is that in that area and in a lot of areas of the project, basically, anything that you see within what we call the "limit of work," which is not just the flood protection but everything outside of it that we're also replacing. Usually the reason that we're replacing those things is that the construction equipment that's necessary to construct the flood wall will be using those areas and their use of those areas requires that we rebuild them. So the whole area of Reach 6, the South Esplanade that you're referring to, from the flood wall to the inner edge of the historic promenade, we do need to reconstruct in some way. So from a cost perspective, there's not a lot of extra that's going on there. It's really the area that we need to replace. However, you're noting a concern about the meandering. You're noting a concern about visibility and safety. We heard those comments also in our last meeting, and we've noted them and as we move forward we will be addressing them. There's a timeline on this where the outreach that we were doing for Reaches 5 and 6 was coming slightly later in our 30 percent design process. So we have this time now to continue to respond to those kinds of comments. BPCA will also be undertaking value engineering on the project as the design advances further.	Flood Barrier System; Circulation
In-Person	To get a sense of the level of disruption to life or usage of the park when different Reaches are being constructed let's take the area between Chamber Street and the Lily Pond, the Duck Pond where you have to extend the wall how far down do you need to go to enforce the wall and what type of equipment do you expect to use and what would the exclusion zone be around that work?	Installed along the entire length of this alignment, for the most part, is what is called a seepage barrier. What happens is when surge comes and hits our wall it's actually creating greater water pressure in the groundwater, which has the tendency to basically push through the sand and come up underneath the wall. And so what we're doing is, we're basically putting a seepage barrier below the center line of the wall to slow down that effect. In some cases that seepage barrier will go to rock. In some cases the seepage barrier will stop above the rock. We're still in the design process and we're trying to figure out the exact depth of that, but it'll be deep -- it'll be 35, 40 feet deep. Again, the goal there is so that when that surge comes, that hydrostatic pressure doesn't come up and undermine the wall.	Flood Barrier System; Construction; Lily Pond
Online	How will the sliding gate "mechanisms" be protected from saltwater damage during a flood? Will they need to be flushed with salt-free water after a flood?	The flood gates are designed to resist corrosion in marine environments and have a lubrication maintenance schedule.	Flood Barrier System; Flooding
Online	Have the "well gates" been tested in other locations? What is the "failure rate" of not being able to close gates during a flood? Does "gate closing" need to be tested periodically to ensure growth or debris doesn't prevent closure in a flood? Has "wall closure" ever failed during a storm? Can a certain gate be chosen not to be closed to "flood" a certain area in order to save other areas?	Floodgate systems have been used throughout the U.S., they've been used throughout the Southwest, they've been used in New York. You can see some of the gates that have been designed in the Lower Manhattan portfolio. You can walk on the East Side, and you can see the gates that are being proposed for the East Side Coastal Resilency (ESCR) Project. All gates are high-reliability designs with low failure rates. All gates are tested and deployed on an annual basis as part of a required operations and maintenance (O&M) schedule. More complex gate types do fail on rare occasion, but usually due to human error. This is why FEMA requires O&M manuals to include training. Gates are never left open to save other areas - coastal flooding does not behave like riverine flooding where intentional flooding upstream can help areas downstream.	Flood Barrier System; Flooding
In-Person	I think this question goes along with what we were just talking about. There was a wonderful op-ed piece in the New York Times on June 5th, I think it was, 2023, which talked about a program of at the mouth of the harbor of New York City having an array of gates to prevent flooding from coming in to all of the whole harbor areas and waterways around New York City. And that has been done in London, in Rotterdam, and Saint Petersburg, Russia, apparently, and is being under consideration in Miami and Galveston and Houston. And it seems to me that that region- wide, harbor-wide area encompassing all of the waterways of New York would do away with the necessity of these myriad local projects, which have the potential to ruin the wonderful access to the coasts that we have in New York. So I just wanted to know if that's being considered as part of this plan and what the status is of exploring that kind of response to the flooding?	When we were talking to the city of Long Beach about the (U.S. Army Corps of Engineers NY & NJ Harbor & Tributaries) "HATS" study, we were reminded of the HATS study that was done in 1970 that had the same alignments and proposed barriers around the same area in New York Harbor. So the problem with such a type of system is that you have to build all of it and then once it's constructed it would protect from surge -- this is true. But it wouldn't protect from climate change. It wouldn't have an impact for the extreme rainfall. It wouldn't have an impact with daily tidal cycles and daily tidal flooding. And so the City of New York has made a decision that Lower Manhattan is protected by a series of projects that are intervening now because the City believes that that's the best approach. There's a lot of technical discussion about the harbor-wide approach. Arcadis was the designer for the areas around Jamaica Bay and Coney Island, and gave the U.S. Army Corps its cost estimates. Arcadis also designed those gates in Rotterdam. So they are valid opinions in both ways, but at this point today, the City of New York, over the past decade, has come up with a policy that says we're going to protect Lower Manhattan sooner in a more real way from a funded perspective with interventions along the shore.	Flood Barrier System; Interagency Coordination

Online	What is the "gate closure" failure rate? Do the gate closure "mechanisms and hardware" need to be flushed with clean water after a salt water flood?	Floodgate systems have been used throughout the U.S. They've been used throughout the Southwest. They've been used in New York. You can see some of the gates that have been designed in the Lower Manhattan portfolio. You can walk on the East Side, and you can see the gates that are being proposed for ESCR [the East Side Coastal Resiliency Project]. What we're trying to do in this project is to create simple gates that have very low levels of mechanical complexity, so that basically what you see is what you get. Those types of gates don't have intense maintenance requirements and are easy to deploy. What we're trying to avoid is overly complex mechanical systems or hydraulically-activated systems that might need more intensive maintenance, or basically might present a problem that you're not aware of until you need to deploy the wall. So we're looking for simplicity. We're looking for robustness. We're looking for transparency from a technical perspective. And yes, the U.S. and the world has a lot of experience deploying these sorts of walls.	Flood Barrier System; Maintenance
Online	Where are other examples of flood walls that have functioned as designed when doubled in height in times of flooding - especially in a robust marine environment such as the one we have on the west side? Who will be responsible and what propulsion system will be used to raise that 2nd half of the wall?	Flood walls can be designed to have both fixed and deployable components. It is not uncommon for walls along rivers to have an upper portion that is deployable for floods. There's a lot of situations around the world where people have chosen to use deployables, including numerous installations in Europe, particularly in the Netherlands. Questions of this sort: What type of mechanized system is being used to lift it in place? How easy is that? How easy is it to maintain these systems? These are all design choices that we have to balance. At 30% we don't have those answers yet but will be exploring as the design progresses. As the designers get more detailed feedback from fabricators and can really wiegh those trade-offs they will come to BPCA with a recommendation, and BPCA will present those plans for public feedback and input.	Flood Barrier System; Maintenance
Online	Who will maintain the glass barriers that are intended to be installed? Authority can hardly maintain existing conditions.	The Battery Park City Authority will be responsible for the maintenance and operations of the flood barrier components of the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project.	Flood Barrier System; Maintenance
In-Person	Three questions; I think under two minutes. First, it doesn't seem to be the issue with Reach 3, which is Rockefeller Park, which is nice. But they were in the scoping document it talks about wave attenuation features, which I assume means some type of hardscape that's going to reduce the volume and velocity of water. If it reduces the volume and velocity of water, can't that also reduce the height of the walls because you have less water coming through with less force? Has that been looked at? Has that been incorporated into the height of the walls? Because that also may reduce and minimize the experience of people and make it unnecessary in terms of a 3-foot wall, 2-foot wall.	In a lot of these different reaches, we're going to be putting attenuation features. For example, on Reach 2, the Plaza in front of Stuyvesant, we're considering shaping the edge of the platform so that the edge itself functions like an attenuation feature. So we're basically taking every possible opportunity to attenuate the wave before the wave hits the wall or the element so that we can minimize the height that we have to build it to. In some cases that's sort of intuitive -- like in Rockefeller Park, there's a lot of park to run through before that wave hits the wall; in some cases it's much closer. And so as a design team, we're looking at all the technologies that are available right now to attenuate so that we can minimize the wall height.	Flood Barrier System; Public Engagement
In-Person	Second: In the South Project, it was discussed that there was a 15-foot tree-free or vegetation-free requirement between flood walls and the vegetation. But I don't see that in a lot of the illustrations. Some I do, but some I see trees right up on the flood walls. I want to know, because of the size or the thickness of the flood walls, can you vary from that particular guideline?	Regarding the 15-foot buffer; yes, that's same requirement we have in the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project our project; there's a certain setback required because whatever we build has to be maintained. And there's concern that any large trees would undermine the wall or undermine the seepage barrier that is going down in some cases 30, 40, 50 feet below grade. So it's the same limit that we're both incorporating in both (the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency and the South Battery Park City Resiliency) projects and its the same requirement that applies. Yes, there are some variances that we can apply for with FEMA, but FEMA is generally very rigid on this point because they don't want the wall to be undermined by a large tree root system, which could compromise the wall.	Flood Barrier System; Public Engagement
Online	Has the Battery Tunnel been shored up such that it will not take water in a future flood? (which would mean BPC will be subject to millions more gallons of water)	The Hugh L. Carey (formerly Brooklyn-Battery) Tunnel has two roughly 45,000 lb. flood gates installed, one on each end, as part of a separate resiliency project completed in 2017.	Flooding
Online	How does this plan account for increased city flooding from rapid heavy rainfall?	The purpose of the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project is to protect from a storm. When we think about the storm mathematically, the storm is really two things: It's rain and surge. And so what we've done is, we've designed the project to achieve what we call the joint probability of both a surge event and a heavy rain. Because what we don't want to do is build a project that has a wall but can be flooded like a bathtub. At the same time, we also don't want the inverse to take place. So we've looked at 10 or 15 different types of combinations of rain and surge occurring, and we've chosen the worst case, and that's our design case. So the project has looked at different intensities of rainfall that are beyond what DEP is requiring right now. The industry is trying to define what we mean by extreme rainfall. But we've certainly looked at more intense rainfalls -- or what might be called a cloud burst -- events that occur over 24 hours and the project defends against that. We've talked about surge and climate change, and the project incorporates that.	Flooding
Online	Can you talk about coordination with the Army Corps HATS project and potential tie in of your project to future measures in Hudson River Park?	BPCA and the project team are coordinating with the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers on the NY&NJ Harbor and Tributaries Study (HATS) study and will continue to engage them as the design progresses.	Interagency Coordination
Online	Who gave BPCA the ability to propose plans for property that is not in your jurisdiction? The Hudson River Park Advisory Council was established by the city and state to advise the Hudson River Park Trust in planning and policy issues. We only received a presentation about BPCA's proposal 2 weeks ago and voiced objections to your plan to platform over the Park's estuarine sanctuary and extending your project into the Park itself. Why weren't we informed and involved earlier? What alternatives are being considered?	Before we started the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project, we had a prior project that was called the North Battery Park City Resiliency Project that started in 2019. We started having conversations with Hudson River Park in 2019 as that project was beginning and we've had conversations with them ever since. We understand that the design that we are showing at 30 percent involves an encroachment into the water area that is owned by Hudson River Park and we have had specific conversations with Hudson River Park about this. We are continuing our conversations. At our recent (June 13, 2023) meeting with the Hudson River Park Advisory Advisory Council we shared this. We do not presume to be able to do this, absent an agreement or some type of mutually-agreeable arrangement with Hudson River Park, so that we are able to extend the Esplanade into that area by a few feet. And we are very diligently exploring ways that we could achieve that which may involve new legislation to adjust that boundary. Or it could involve some type of mutually-acceptable agreement between Battery Park City Authority and Hudson River Park. But we're not proceeding unilaterally, nor are we presuming to be able to do that absent an arrangement that would be acceptable to Hudson River Park. [**Presentation** from June 13, 2023 HRPK Advisory Council meeting is here: https://media.bpca.ny.gov/wp-content/uploads/2023/06/14115538/HRPT-Advisory-Council-Presentation-June-13-2023.pdf; **Video** from that meeting is here: https://www.youtube.com/watch?app=desktop&v=geHo8ZuJUXo]	Interagency Coordination
Online	What feedback have Transportation Alternatives, HRP and State DOT given on the walling in of the Bike Path? Were alternatives looked at within 9A?	Both City and State Department of Transportation have been active participants in coordination relate to this project. The conversations with both entities are ongoing as we look at design options for Route 9A. Related to Transportation Alternatives, we will also coordinate as appropriate related to bike and pedestrian access.	Interagency Coordination; Bike Path
Online	At Lily Pool slide - What are the options for Reach 2 if any extension is not possible?	If a Reach 2 extension is not possible, an elevated platform will be designed that fits within the footprint of the current platform.	Lily Pond

In-Person	Thank you for your presentation. And I thought the pictures are very pretty and they look fantastic. But you kind of disappointed me a little bit because you didn't talk about your underlying assumptions. Namely, what you are building against. I understand that you are looking into as far as the years 2050. And I'd like to know what you were thinking about in terms of how high sea level rise will be, which impacts, of course, what your construction requirements would be. I would like to know what you're thinking about in terms of the flooding possibilities from heavier weather, and will that impact your drainage and your sewage systems? I think what you're doing is basically talking about what people are basically interested in, what they're seeing right now, as opposed to what it is that we are trying to prevent, which is as much flooding as possible and as much damage caused by sea level rise. And I'd really like to know where you're coming from originally about all this.	The inundation map has the hundred-year return frequency and 30 inches of climate change. And the 30 inches of climate change is the 90 percent 2050s. So let's break that down. The hundred-year return frequency is the frequency that's set by FEMA and requires us to design for the hundred-year return frequency for the surge because that's what affects the insurance. We can't go higher or lower than that because when we do the map revision for their protected area, it's based upon the hundred-year return frequency. So that's the surge components. From a climate change component, yes; we're assuming 30 inches for 2050. And we recognize that the City of New York is constantly studying what's the latest science, what's the latest data, and what are the latest projections. NPCC 4 which is the City-led agency that establishes governance on how the different projects throughout the city assume climate change in alignment with one another, there's some consideration right now of a different value for the 2050 milestone for climate change. That said, what's being discussed right now is that the 2080s projection remains unchanged, so we are basically waiting for the City to finalize this guidance and we're going to conform to that guidance. 2050 is basically right around the corner from this project, because the project's going to take a certain time to build and the reality of it is that's pretty close to where this project begins. Most of the things that we're building here have at least a 50-year life. So what we want to do as designers is think about what happens in 2060, 2070, 2080, 2090. And we want to bake into this project the right assumptions so that we don't have to revisit the project and modify the wall in any way which would be expensive, intrusive, and have impacts that are like the original construction. So we're trying to do our best right now to anticipate the life of this project, make the right assumptions and be in alignment with the City's guidance. So the question was: Is what we're building going to be scalable? The answer is yes. So when we go through the design of these walls we ask ourselves, is there a way we can modify this wall so that it could possibly be elevated a bit in the future? We're going to think about those design choices and see what they affect in terms of the foundation design and where it makes sense we're going to do that, because we want to have a wall that's adaptable. We've talked before about Rockefeller Park and having small interventions into the current area in Rockefeller Park; gets a little bit wet during heavy rains; right? Maybe in 10 and 20 years more than just some small projects with under drains will be necessary at that point as climate change affects the area and the edge of Rockefeller Park. So I think the project has a vision of being adaptive to what takes place with our climate. And as designers we want to be adapted to that as well. Also of note: The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project is part of the City's overall Lower Manhattan Coastal Resiliency Project (LMCR). And that set of projects, which includes the Brooklyn Bridge Montgomery-Coastal Resilience Project (BMCR), the Authority's own South Battery Park City Resiliency Project, the Battery Coastal Resiliency Project, the FiDi Seaport Project, all of them have been designed with at least an expectation of 30 inches of sea level rise. And that's important for all of the reasons described above. We want to maintain consistency with those projects. We want to maintain the ability to adapt to future needs, because all of the projections are continuing to go up. There's not a point at which they turn around and come down. They continue to go up. So we know that at least a couple of those projects now; the Battery Coastal Project, and the FiDi Seaport Project; they're actually looking even further out at 2100. So we want to make sure that the criteria for our project -- the 2050s 100-year-storm with 30 inches of sea level rise -- maintains that consistency and that ability to adapt to future conditions.	Modeling
In-person	This question concerns DFE. Have you taken into account the latest predictions on sea level rise that were released in 2023 for the NY region, following the IPCC 2022 report? They are lower than NYPCC 2019. Have you done any wave action modeling that takes into account the current features of Rockefeller Park?	The system is being designed for 2.5 feet of sea level rise (SLR). If new studies determine that SLR is occurring at a slower rate than previously expected, the system may benefit from a longer useable life. Coastal modeling performed for the design did include the topographic features of Rockefeller Park.	Modeling
Online	Do you have any study regarding the increased volume and velocity of water that will be redirected from BPC's flood barriers toward Hudson River Park? Has this been done?	An advanced circulation (ADCIRC) model is currently being created to determine if any storm surge is redirected to Hudson River Park.	Modeling
Online	How will pedestrian access to the South Cove Promenade be affected by this plan both during construction and after?	The short answer is that the limit of work extends to the edge of the historic promenade. So basically the flood protection system is the orange line here [**watch accompanying video segment here:** https://youtu.be/hDHbRtLrwQQ?t=9608] and then the limit of work, which is basically the area that construction machinery will be operating, and which needs to be reconstructed after construction of the flood wall is finished, is within this boundary. The current intent is to keep this open for as much as possible of the project. The construction team is still working on how that staging will occur, and there are areas up around Gateway Plaza where we will be doing work on the promenade itself. But we do think there's an opportunity here to preserve some public access during construction.	Pedestrian access
Online	Have all the public agencies such as the Army Corps, NYS DEC and DOT, NYC DEP and Hudson River Park Trust + all others approved your 30% design? If not, when will they approve?	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team continue sto coordinate with all of these and other agencies not mentioned as the design is developed. We will need their approval and that occurs later in the design process.	Procedure
In person	Is it true that only BPC residents are paying for this project? No federal money is going to this project. Is the Authority taking out a bond against the ground rent? Due to principal, and interest it will result in ground rent raises for the residents.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project is slated to be funded through BPCA-issued bonds. Though BPCA certainly would be receptive to the possibility of viable alternative funding sources, applicable guidance related to the potential for award of federal funds for our resiliency projects suggests that the projects would be deemed ineligible for federal funding, given that both a sufficient existing revenue stream and an existing finance structure exist to pay for the project, it would not be positioned to successfully compete for federal funding against projects for which funding alternatives are unavailable. Pursuing the project using the Authority's financing capabilities enables the work to move forward expeditiously, at no additional cost to residents and property owners of Battery Park City. Put differently, not issuing these bonds – and not spending money to service that debt each year – would not reduce what Battery Park City residents pay in ground rent (which is contractual) or PILOT (which is determined by the NYC Department of Finance), as ground rent and PILOT are not determined by the Authority's debt load. Not issuing these bonds would simply mean that more money is passed from the Authority to the City of New York, rather than being spent in Battery Park City here to protect Battery Park City and Lower Manhattan.	Project Budget
Online	Reach 1 projects property outside of BPC. Is this part of the project fully funded by BPCA?	Yes, we expect it will be fully paid for using Battery Park City Authority bonds.	Project Budget
Online	What parts of the design are final and not subject to change? When is the deadline for changes/large scale changes like changing the alignment? The public and CBI have asked that the engineers answer any remaining questions at a follow up meeting to explain vs only an online post. Is that possible for July or September?	The June 26, 2023 public meeting is the first design milestone (30% -- except as noted in some portions (Reaches 1, 2, and 5) where the design is not yet at 30%) -- where we try to reflect the feedback and input we've received from the community and from the stakeholders and from the agencies to date. Later this fall, in the November timeframe, would be our next public meeting -- a "Post 30% Design Update Meeting" -- including updates based on what we heard at the June meeting, and since the June meeting, how it's been incorporated, as well as to have the areas that were not quite at the 30% design mark (Reaches 1, 2, and 5) a little further advanced for public review and input. Of course, what the community sees later this fall will then be open for robust feedback through the end of the year as the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project moves beyond the 30% design milestone.	Project Timeline; Public Engagement
Online	How can residents have a say on the actual project itself? If majority of residents are against this, how can they advocate to make sure the project does not progress. We have seen what happened with Wagner Park where clearly resident views were not taken into account.	As BPCA does on all resiliency work, working closely with community partners the Authority will be providing additional opportunities for community engagement in this fall and throughout the course of the project's design development and construction. The Authority is also pleased to have developed the South Battery Park City Resiliency Project (SBPCR) design after five years of close community collaboration and feedback, over the course of which many residents' views were taken into account. A full listing of community presentations, portions of which include descriptions of the public feedback incorporated along the way, can be found under 'COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT VIDEOS & PRESENTATIONS' tile on the dedicated SBPCR Project website here: https://bpca.ny.gov/sbpcrp/	Public Engagement

Online	What is the plan for getting out signage about the project and publishing a calendar of touchpoints for 2024?	Signage is posted in parks kiosks throughout Battery Park City with information about the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project and how to get involved. This signage will remain in place over the course of the project's design work, and is *in addition* to specific notices about upcoming public meeting/engagement sessions that will be posted conspicuously in physical and digital formats as these engagements are scheduled. Public meeting/engagement sessions are usually planned about 3-4 weeks in advance in consultation (and so as not to conflict) with Manhattan Community Board 1 (CB1) and other project partner schedules. We plan to be back to CB1 this fall – and prior to advancing to 60% design – as our design team continues to address comments received from the public and from public agencies. Accordingly, we have also extended through the end of October the online feedback tool for the project's 30% design milestone, which can be accessed here: https://dotstorming.com/b/6495d64c2fb42805abf9ece3 NWBPCR Project Sitewalks are also scheduled to occur in October 2023 as follows: Sitewalk 1: Reaches 1-4, Thursday, October 19, 3:30-6PM. This session will cover: West St. Crossing/Tribeca, North Esplanade, Rockefeller Park, and Belvedere Plaza. Sitewalk 2: Reaches 1-4, Saturday, October 21, 10AM-12PM. This session will cover: West St. Crossing/Tribeca, North Esplanade, Rockefeller Park, and Belvedere Plaza. (Rain date October 22.) Sitewalk 3: Reaches 5-7, Saturday, October 21, 1:00-3:00PM. This session will cover: North Cove, South Esplanade, and South Cove. (Rain date Cotboer 22.) Sitewalk 4: Reaches 5-7, Tuesday, October 26, 3:30-6:00PM. This session will cover: North Cove, South Esplanade, and South Cove.	Public Engagement
In-Person	As the head of the Environmental Protection Committee, thank you for letting me speak for a minute. I know I appreciated the presentation and I recognize your commitment to engaging the community fully. And I know that's very important to you and your pointing out good examples of where this has worked for you. And there are a lot of sophisticated people in this community that understand these problems intimately. It's not just the designers and the engineers that are a part of your team. So it's a great and can potentially be a great win-win. And with this in mind, I would really thought there are things that could be done here going forward in the year where you're approaching 60 percent to engage much more fully, if I may say. One of the things that I know the community has asked for many times are models. And I know that they exist. It would be helpful to have an ability to see these models in three dimensions. It's difficult for people to fully appreciate each section and Reach without that. I think that would be greatly helpful; whatever models exist. And more or more three-dimensional drawings. I imagine there are models for some of these Reaches. And two, that each reach is now reviewed maybe at the community board, maybe at our committee like it used to be at Wagner Park, where people can really dive in and understand what is going on in each one of these areas. And it's very hard; myself as a professional and an architect, I find it difficult to read these and at a very good pace sit this one through. I appreciate this. A lot of information that has to be covered and that's why I'm advocating for each reach, which I think over the course of a few months can happen. And I think those two things would help a great deal. And then the third thing that I know we talked about, which would be great, is to make good on the promise to do some of these walkthroughs in the area with the designers and team. Again, at Wagner Park; that was the wonderful exercise that some of you all showed up, came out, we walked around. Those of us who participated greatly benefited. So we I thought that was happening this spring, but it didn't seem to happen. So is that something that we can? So those are three asks that I'm hoping that we can get a commitment to. The meetings on the Reaches, each one, the walk through, and some more three-dimensional renderings and models to be seen by the community.	A digital flythrough model ran concurrently with the June 26, 2023 public meeting and is available online here: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ExBchKeKvB4. We don't have physical models at this point, but will expect to have those as the design progresses further -- and the further we get along, the more three-dimensional materials can really help you to understand things. We plan to be back to Manhattan Community Board 1 (CB1) this fall – and prior to advancing to 60% design – as our design team continues to address comments received from the public and from public agencies. Accordingly, we have also extended through the end of September the online feedback tool for the project's 30% design milestone, which can be accessed here: https://dotstorming.com/b/6495d64c2fb42805abf9ece3 NWBPCR Project Sitewalks are also scheduled to occur in October 2023 as follows: Sitewealk 1: Reaches 1-4, Thursday, October 19, 3:30-6PM. This session will cover: West St. Crossing/Tribeca, North Esplanade, Rockefeller Park, and Belvedere Plaza. Sitewalk 2: Reaches 1-4, Saturday, October 21, 10AM-12PM. This session will cover: West St. Crossing/Tribeca, North Esplanade, Rockefeller Park, and Belvedere Plaza. (Rain date October 22.) Sitewalk 3: Reaches 5-7, Saturday, October 21, 1:00-3:00PM. This session will cover: North Cove, South Esplanade, and South Cove. (Rain date Cotboer 22.) Sitewalk 4: Reaches 5-7, Tuesday, October 26, 3:30-6:00PM. This session will cover: North Cove, South Esplanade, and South Cove.	Public Engagement
Online	This is a large overview - and large areas of Reach 1, 2, and the areas around North Cove are still not able to be determined... will those Reaches be presented again with updated info before the BPCA takes further steps forward?	Updates to Reaches 1, 2, and 5 that were not presented at the June 26, 2023 public meeting will be discussed with the community later this fall with the prior to the design advancing further.	Public Engagement
Online	What are the two biggest risks to the proposed solution functioning to design? What mitigations are being thought of to avoid the risks from being realized?	Ongoing coordination on Reach 2 with Hudson River Park is a significant dialogue. Completely separate from that is a dialogue we have to have with the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (DEC) and the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (USACE). And anytime you extend a platform over a water body you have to mitigate the effect of that. So we're really wrestling with that proposed design, which is what the community wanted, and it expanded the Esplanade. And the issues of environmental minimization and avoidance and mitigation. Over the course of the project we're doing certain things like installing piles where they weren't before. And we're displacing the water that the piles are going to displace. So there's a lot of environmental impacts and we're in a lot of conversations with DEC and USACE. That's also going to be a public dialogue because it's going to go through the SEQR permitting process and the joint permit application permitting process. And you'll be able to see how we try to avoid and minimize the environmental impacts and how we propose to mitigate them. In addition, the risk is probably mostly in terms of time. It's not that we wouldn't be able to come up with a way of doing the project or making the project effective. It's probably that the biggest risk is one of time and schedule.	Public Engagement
Online	Do the gray areas in your images indicate that those areas are untouched?	In the public material presented, the areas that are "faded-out" represent areas that are outside of the current Limit Of Work and will not be directly impacted by construction work under the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project.	Public Engagement

Online	Covering so much land/reaches without a break to ask questions on each or at least be a few sections is overwhelming to process. You are familiar with the plans - the public less so.	Prior to the June 26, 2023 North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project public meeting, BPCA conducted a series of reach-specific workshops in Febrary and March 2023. These meetings were working sessions where attendees sat side-by-side the architects and engineers designing the protective measures to meet lower Manhattan's resiliency needs while keeping our parks and public spaces vibrant and appealing. These reach specific meetings followed September 2022 NWBPCR public meeting, which covered the project in full. Input from that meeting, including feedback that it was a laege area to cover in one session, led to the smaller and more focused reach-specific sessions in February & March; feedback gleaned from those reach-specific meetings was incorporated and presened to the community for review and additonal feedback at the June 2023 meeting. We plan to be back to Manhattan Community Board 1 (CB1) this fall – and prior to advancing to 60% design – as our design team continues to address comments received from the public and from public agencies. Accordingly, we have also extended through the end of September the online feedback tool for the project's 30% design milestone, which can be accessed here: https://dotstorming.com/b/6495d64c2fb42805abf9ece3 NWBPCR Project Sitewalks are also scheduled to occur in October 2023 as follows: Sitewealk 1: Reaches 1-4, Thursday, October 19, 3:30-6PM. This session will cover: West St. Crossing/Tribeca, North Esplanade, Rockefeller Park, and Belvedere Plaza. Sitewalk 2: Reaches 1-4, Saturday, October 21, 10AM-12PM. This session will cover: West St. Crossing/Tribeca, North Esplanade, Rockefeller Park, and Belvedere Plaza. (Rain date October 22.) Sitewalk 3: Reaches 5-7, Saturday, October 21, 1:00-3:00PM. This session will cover: North Cove, South Esplanade, and South Cove. (Rain date Cotboer 22.) Sitewalk 4: Reaches 5-7, Tuesday, October 26, 3:30-6:00PM. This session will cover: North Cove, South Esplanade, and South Cove.	Public Engagement
Online	Before final alignment decision are made, the community keeps asking for models and fly through visuals. We need these to be able to move forward and understand the impacts.	Fly-through visuals were prepared for the June 26 North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project public meeting and are linked here: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ExBchKeKvB4. As the designs are updated, these will also be updated. BPCA also has heard the community's requests for scale models, and these will be created and available for the public to view as the design advances.	Public Engagement
Online	Way too much concrete - looks like most of the flower beds and benches are removed -need more green, not less.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is working to maximize planted areas to the extend possible, and where applicable, while ensuring adequate hardscape areas for accessible circulation and program uses.	Public Realm
Online	What changes will be done to the marina to help modernize the marina, mitigate the rough waters and reduce the influx of garbage? What changes are planned for the numbers of floating docks, boats slips, school and marina infrastructure?	There's are no changes currently envisioned to the operations of the boat docking, the sailing school, etc. The flood protection is all upland of that. There is a curved section of the platform (we're envisioning the same thing on the other side) over the lower platform footprint. So, if anything, there will be a little bit less space in those two corners. But we don't expect that to significantly impact any of the circulation or boat operations becuase most of the work is actually happening away from the North Cove Marina itself. re: garbage: The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team acknowledges this comment and is taking it into consideration in the design process.	Public Realm
Online	Can you add a bathroom to Rockefeller Park?	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team notes the request and can explore this possibility.	Public Realm OKAY?
Online	Will the walls block views that will impact public safety? Meaning, will it makes it difficult to see what is happening from the street?	The flood barrier system (FBS) wall height varies throughout the project as determined by critical flood protection needs. Where possible, views from the street into the park will be maintained.	Safety
Online	I am concerned that this wall along the West Side Highway will make the area less safe re: The assaults on people along the West Side Highway that have happened in the last year. A wall hides the space from being visible.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is studying crossings in high pedestrian and cyclist areas in order to ensure safety of surfaces for crossing.	Safety
Online	Particular for the low portions of the walls and the openings that need to close, please consider children climbing on the walls and attract nuisance hazards, to avoid injuries.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team acknowledges this comment and is taking it into consideration in the design process.	Safety
In-Person	Thank you. I appreciate all the comments. I'm a tree lover and just wondering how many mature trees you will need to remove and who's going to be advocating for the ones that are, sort of, in question as you move into the 60 percent phase?	There's been a major theme of this project, to protect the trees, and we recognize that trees are integral to the identity of the Authority's property. We we do not yet have an exact count of the trees impacted, as the design continues to be detailed out and the construction, staging, and phasing continues to detail out, we'll have more specific information on what trees are specifically going to be impacted and how we're going to mitigate those that could be impacted. It is worth nothing that to date the design choices the project team has developed have aimed at trying to avoid the mature trees, and minimizing impacts on trees generally. As a matter of fact, our approach for the playground area was specifically chosen to avoid the impacts of the trees along River Terrace. So we're constantly thinking about tree protection and tree preservation to protect the beloved trees here, because of their importance to the identity of this area.	Trees
Online	Trees in south BPC are so essential, they provide cool conditions during summer, apartments don't need much air conditioning usage, especially along the Esplanade/South Cove. Cutting trees and planting small young ones will eliminate that. How are you planning to address this?	The reality is that when trees come down, we have to plant new trees and they're not going to be as big. The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team, however, is looking at opportunities to replant as much as possible, to meet and exceed the kind of number of trees that would be removed. **Read more about BPCA's Tree & Biodiversity Inventory efforts here:** https://bpca.ny.gov/community/bpc-sustainability-plan-tree-biodiversity-inventory/	Trees
Online	Based on the design alternatives presented, how do we know how many trees will have to be removed and what percent of trees will be maintained, replanted? Could we consider adding more trees rather than lose the level we currently have?	We are still working to figure out the exact tree count, but the goal is to minimize the impact to trees, and to exceed the number of trees that would be removed as a result of the project. We're also working with an arborist to on updated tree survey* that really allows us to understand the condition and health of trees across all of Battery Park City and identify areas where we can add more trees. One of the challenges with the wall is that we cannot plant new trees within 15 feet of the wall. So we really want to make the opportunities to add more trees where possible. Another thing we're looking at is really considering how climate change impacts what kinds of trees we plant, making sure that we're being adaptable to raising heat levels, increased storm, extreme weather events, and increased salinity in general. *** Read more about BPCA's Tree & Biodiversity Inventory efforts here:** https://bpca.ny.gov/community/bpc-sustainability-plan-tree-biodiversity-inventory/	Trees
Online	Can you outline your plan for the mature trees in Rockefeller Park?	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is working to minimize tree removal to the greatest extent possible. In Rockefeller Park, the trees on the lawn will be minimally impacted. However, trees along the flood barrier system will need to be removed due to the required FEMA offsets from the flood wall. The project team is prioritizing replanting trees in this area and carefully considering the tree species appropriate for the climate, conditions, and biodiversity targets of the project.	Trees
Online	Can the Authority buy as part of the project a tree transplanting machine so we can save and transplant these mature trees instead of planting junior trees that will take years to provide the shade and fauna protection they give now?	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is looking into this tree preservation strategy and will determine if it is appropriate for the project.	Trees
In-Person	Thanks for the presentation. If you could please go back to the Rockefeller Park slide, that would be helpful. Curious if you could speak a little bit more please too; I see it says minor impacts to lawn. What specifically that means, and if any of the trees will be impacted, that would be helpful.	Currently right now during heavy rains, there's a bit of a swale in Rockefeller Park where the water could collect. And so the project team is trying to find a way that it can do a minor intervention and include some drainage pipes in the middle lawn. So basically what this really represents here is, maybe just enhancing some of the drainage, we don't have those swales, because right now during heavy rain events, the water kind of ponds there and that's a nuisance. So it's a minor -- not exactly surgical -- but it's a very discrete part of the project.	Trees; Public Realm
Online	Will the walls block the views that restaurant diners and the public seating now enjoy?	We're doing our best to do two things: We're trying to balance how we can prevent the impacts of an upcoming storm, yet at the same time allow the current uses of the Brookfield Plaza area to exist. So what we showed in our design is our way of keeping the wall height as minimized as possible to not impact those views. And we're continuing to balance this issue throughout the project because we don't want to have those viewers impacted significantly in these Reaches. For all Reaches, the project looking to balance maintaining views and maintaining people's experience versus the goal of the project -- to protect Battery Park City and Lower Manhattan.	Views
Online	Please elaborate how tall the walls will be around Pumphouse Park vs what it is now. Will you be able to see the water from inside the park like you do now?	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is in the process of looking at a broad array of alternatives for the Pumphouse Park area, and recognizes the constraint between Pumphouse Park and the edge of the North Cove Marina.	Views

Online	Can you please address maintaining views along residential property near the esplanade to help maintain and not diminish owners values? It's not just about Brookfield pedestrian areas.	The flood barrier system (FBS) wall height varies throughout the project as determined by critical flood protection needs. Where possible, views from residential properties will be maintained. Notably, the FBS system is also designed to protect those same residential properties and maintain their value and insurability.	Views
Online	Are transparent walls an option in certain areas?	Impact-resistant glass panels can be used in areas where watercraft impacts are not expected.	Views
In-Person	Resident and homeowner here. First of all, thanks for the presentation, all the work and the thoughtfulness; really appreciate it. I think two points for me. First, for the wall and River Terrace, I just noticed that all the other walls I appreciate the integration, but that one just seemed like it was just, you know, like a 9-foot wall, or at least it appeared that way without any sort of integration and, sort of, blocked the water views. So I just want to highlight that. Second, I think would be helpful and I know cost has come up quite a bit, you know, among some of the questions here. And I think what would be helpful is with respect to let's say, ongoing maintenance costs, and I'm talking about insurance costs for the buildings that, you know, are on the other side of the wall, etcetera. Like, has there been any studies or engagement with insurance companies, given that we are in zone one year on that? And also in terms of building materials, maintenance costs for the new green areas etcetera, is that also being considered from a cost standpoint? Because I think would be great. And I don't know if this is achievable or not, if there -- a case could be made for lower maintenance costs going forward, at least to some degree. You know, as a result of this capital expenditure.	Fly-through visuals and renderings will continue to be updated as the project's designs are updated, with BPCA also undertaking value engineering on the project as the design advances further. The NWBPCR Project is expected to be accredited by the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA). Accreditation requires a FEMA review and verification that the flood system meets all pertinent requirements and achieves an acceptable level of risk reduction. FEMA accreditation will remove the project area from the current flood zone. As a result, owners in the area who have a federally-backed mortgage would no longer be required to obtain flood insurance. BPCA will be responsible for the operations and maintenance of NWBPCR when complete.	Views; Budget; Maintenance
In-Person	I have a three-part question. It'll be under two minutes for sure. You mentioned the walls are adaptable, or the project is. Are they specifically scalable in the sense that the walls going by, let's say, Rockefeller Park by the playground, instead of raising it above, you know, an extra two feet, can they just make it to the same height but due to the thickness of the wall could just be built on if they found that water levels are becoming higher and higher? So instead of just blocking views, you can scale up? That's the first part of the question. Next, you were talking about drainage of Rockefeller Park. Just want to highlight that in Teardrop Park between the buildings in the middle, I've seen just on rainy days the border get puddling. Are they looking at the drainage there? Because we can get flooded from obviously from the sky. And then lastly, the duck pond area just for clarity's sake, it wasn't clear to me, I'll just mention it the space between the Irish Hunger Memorial and the actual duck pond, is that going to be shortened? Because right now there's a nice open space for kids to play. Is that going to be changed in any way from in that drawing, it's hard to tell from the distance from where you enter the Irish Hunger Memorial to, let's say, by the duck pond. It's a good amount of distance where people hang out and whatnot. Is that going to be impacted?	1) Regarding the first question about foundations. When you build flood protection systems, most of the money is in the foundations; right? Because, you know, you're building a wall, but all the stuff underground is really where the money is; right? Because you have to make sure that wall doesn't tilt when it gets pushed by water. So you have to have a footing, your footing has to have piles, those piles have to go down deep, you have to have that seepage wall that goes down as well. And so a large part of the cost is what takes place below grade. And, like I said before, we're going to look for opportunities in this project where the design of those elements below grade can be expanded in a way that makes cost sense right now so that we can have more adaptability in what's built above ground. 2) The second question is for Teardrop Park and drainage -- that's a great point. The design team will take that back and we'll investigate that further. You know, we've heard a lot about Rockefeller Park and, sort of, the "swaling." And you could see in the heavy rain day, like, it's like a little pond in the middle there; right? So we're clearly responding to that. But it's a great point about Teardrop Park. 3) As to the third question: This is the kind of thing that's really nice to have feedback on at this point in the design phase. Obviously in this area we heard a lot of feedback about the Lily Pond at the workshop in February. So we really took that into consideration with the design. There is a substantial Plaza here and we understand that there's a lot of programming that goes on now. And I think it's something we can work with the Authority to find the right balance between planting area -- new planting areas and also the hardscape to, kind of, continue to have that that programmable area. One thing we also heard a lot of feedback on was the desire to increase planting in this area around the walls. So I think we just want to make sure we find that balance of creating a more berm-like expression that really hides the walls. The team is studying whether or not -- are necessary, for example, and really trying to strike the right balance there. Where some of that space came from in order to, sort of, thread the needle here. Currently there is about a 20-foot-wide path that cuts down to the ferry terminal. We're looking at making that closer to 10 or 12 feet. So I think some of that hardscape is being taken out of the west side.	Views; Drainage System; Circulation; Public Realm
	And the last part: Many of these diagrams are from the water view. Can we get more illustrations in the future what it would look like from people from the street view or the seating view? You do have that with that one illustration that you showed of the Plaza. But if we could do that with more of the it would better inform us.	We're representing these, trying to show certain things that we think folks in the community would want to see, but certainly having more views from the water side or from the backside, we can certainly reflect that in future meetings.	

Comment Cards (pp 10)

Comment	Response	Topic
Rockefeller Playground Can the wall be 1/2 deployable? Similar to what's being deployed along the bike path? ~or~ Are there any landscape elements that can lower the wall height? Children won't be able to see over the wall.	In order to minimize the number of deployable elements in the Flood Barrier System (and reduce the time to activate for a storm), passive design was used where walls already exist.	Flood Barrier System; Rockefeller Playground
Linking the alignment to the North of BPC: Who is picking up where the BPCA leaves off at N. Moore St.? Are we in communication with that project to make sure alignments line up?	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is coordinating with the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers on the NY & NJ Harbor & Tributaries Study (HATS) study, which would cover the area north of North Moore Street and will continue to engage them as the design progresses.	Interagency coordination; Reach 1
I think at this point there are only very minor complaints remaining - in general I think that a lot of our (the community's) feedback has been taken into account and the design is minimally disruptive. This project is necessary to maintain our ability to live in this neighborhood and to maintain the values of our apartments.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team thanks you and appreciates the positive feedback.	Flood Barrier System
Concern about the lack of understanding of the budget at this 30% design phase. Also, since costs may well be higher than current $2B, why isn't federal, state and city money being utilized? It seems like the Project Team is going through all the regulations and inputs that are required for this public money. Why not take advantage of it?	As the project has not yet been designed, cost detail is not yet available. After a preliminary design is formulated, a budget estimate will be developed. It is anticipated that the project will be funded by the Authority's issuance of bonds, which are financed through monies that the City of New York allows to stay in Battery Park City for BPCA capital projects. Though the BPCA certainly would be receptive to the possibility of viable alternative funding sources, applicable guidance related to the potential for award of federal funds for our resiliency projects suggests that the projects would be deemed ineligible for federal funding since, given that both a sufficient existing revenue stream and an existing finance structure exist to pay for the project, it would not be positioned to successfully compete for federal funding against projects for which funding alternatives are unavailable. Pursuing the project using the Authority's financing capabilities enables the work to move forward expeditiously, at no additional cost to residents and property owners of Battery Park City.	Budget
More bike lanes please.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is studying crossings in high pedestrian and cyclist areas in order to ensure safety of surfaces for crossing.	Bike lanes
Alignment with Wagner Park at connecting.	Question is unclear.	Alignment

General Board & Map Comments (pp 11-13)

Area	Comment	Response	Topic(s)
Large Format Table	Is the flood barrier at Gateway on the east or west side of the property?	It is on the west side.	Flood Barrier System
Large Format Table	Why is the wall so high at playground? Why is this the best solution?	The height of the wall is designed to prevent overtopping from a future 100-year storm surge (including up to 2.5 feet of sea level rise).	Flood Barrier System
Large Format Table	How are we calculating the wall height we need?	The wall height is determined by coastal modeling that accounts for future storm surge with wave action and sea level rise.	Flood Barrier System
Large Format Table	What happens to water that's trapped by the wall?	Trapped water will drain into the existing stormwater system.	Flood Barrier System
Large Format Table	Are the gates tested?	Yes, the gates will be required to have testing performed annually.	Flood Barrier System
Large Format Table	Wall in front of 365 South End Way Ave - wall in front of pool. During Sandy, watched the height of the surge at 9 p.m. and the water went over the railing where the Esplanade meets the River and came back to the existing wall, but didn't come over the ex	Wheil seemingly incomplete the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team thanks this participant and notes their partial comment.	Flood Barrier System
Large Format Table	Given the constraints, this is really great, but given the world, we are going to end up not needing this in the end	The Battery Park City Authority is responsible for maintaining the neighborhood's 92 acre site and reducing the risks to its 16,000 residents and tens of thousands daily employees from the increasing risks of storm surge and sea level rise.	Flood Barrier System
Boards	The gray FBS wall looks ugly in the pictures.	The flood barrier system (FBS) wall materiality is currently being studied, thank you for your input.	Flood Barrier System
Boards	Why can't the wall be retractable/deployable along River Terrace? Other countries have deployable flood walls.	In order to minimize the number of deployable elements in the FBS (and reduce the time to activate for a storm), passive design was used where walls already exist.	Flood Barrier System
Boards	Why is a floodwall not being installed in the northern end of River Terrace, is the current wall strong enough, or just tall enough?	The land in that area, including the paved portions of sidewalk, are higher than the design flood elevation and materials below the surface do not allow for seepage to occur based on the latest geotechnical studies and findings.	Flood Barrier System
Large Format Table	Reach 5 near the Police Memorial - choke point is of major concern/ Has there ever been consideration to let Pumphouse flood?	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is studying crossings in high pedestrian and cyclist areas in order to ensure safety of surfaces for crossing. Design for Pumphouse Park is ongoing, but the NWBPCR project team isn't contemplating flooding Pumphouse Park.	Flooding
Boards	Are the existing conditions meant for flood protection?	The existing conditions are shown in order to illustrate current infrastructure and elevations.	Flooding
Large Format Table	Want explanation of what the test is looking for and how far down it's going?	Unclear question	Interagency Coordination
Large Format Table	If 9A is going to be widened on one side, make it the east not the west because that's what pedestrians use.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is studying crossings in high pedestrian and cyclist areas in order to ensure safety of surfaces for crossing.	Pedestrian access
Large Format Table	A beach should be added at North Cove.	Thank you for your input, the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team continues to refine the design of the North Cove Marina area.	Pedestrian access
Large Format Table	Were alternatives considered for making the wall shorter at Rockefeller Park?	The wall at Rockefeller Park is already at the project minimum and least tall wall in the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project.	Pedestrian access
Boards	None of the seating has back support	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team will work to incoporate additional back supports, arm rests, and companion seating to maximize universal accessibility and comfort for all users.	Pedestrian access
Boards	Why redo the playground, it was just finished a few years ago?	In order to provide for continuous flood protection along the waterfront, a flood wall must be constructed along River Terrace. This will result in unavoidable impacts to the playground. The refurbished Rockefeller Park Playground re-opened in October 2020, so by the time it is impacted by the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project, the community will have enjoyed this new playground for roughly five years.	Playground
Boards	Since the playground was just rebuilt, why not wait a few more years to reconstruct the area in front of it. Did the pressure to reconstruct this area come from BPCA or from the engineers?	Constructing the flood wall adjacent to the playground is necessary in order to have a continuous flood barrier system along the waterfront. The refurbished Rockefeller Park Playground re-opened in October 2020, so by the time it is impacted by the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project, the community will have enjoyed this new playground for roughly five years.	Playground

Large Format Table	How is this being financed and will it come from increased ground rent?	Indirectly, the City of New York is paying for Battery Park City's resiliency projects, so the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project will not result in increased ground rent of PILOT payments. In this case, the NWBPCR project will be funded by the Authority's issuance of bonds, which are financed through monies that the City of New York allows to stay in Battery Park City for BPCA capital projects. Without BPCA, 100% of the ground rent and PILOT collected from Battery Park City residents would go straight to the City of New York to be spent across the five boroughs.	Project Budget
Boards	Why is BPCA paying for the FBS wall along North Moore Street, it is not within BPCA property?	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project area established for the location of the project's flood barrier system spans the length of the Battery Park City waterfront, from the waterside edge of neighborhood's buildings to the edge of the Battery Park City Esplanade at the pierhead line in the Hudson River, between First Place and the North Esplanade. Additionally, the project area includes the area necessary to connect to high ground where the Design Flood Elevation (DFE) meets existing grade at the intersection of Greenwich Street and North Moore Street.	Project Budget
Boards	Can the contact information of someone knowledgeable about the project be shared publicly to field questions?	Inquiries about the project can be sent to the project team at nwbpcrinfo@bpca.ny.gov.	Public Engagement
Boards	Can a recording/link of a recording of the last Gateway Plaza Zoom meeting be shared with the public?	The meeting has been posted on the dedicated NWBPCR project page (https://bpca.ny.gov/nwbpcr/) under "Community Engagement Videos & Presentations" tile and is also linked as follows: **Gateway Plaza Tenants Association: May 24, 2023** Presentation: https://media.bpca.ny.gov/wp-content/uploads/2023/06/06155950/GPTA-Briefing-re-NWBPCR-May-24-2023.pdf Video: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=teyoga2J3Qk	Public Engagement
Large Format Table	What will happen to Kowski playground and volleyball? How long will court be closed for?	Kowksy Plaza is characterized by the privacy walls located toward the north part of the Plaza. We've tried to align ourselves with those existing privacy walls so that the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project is not changing the experience that people currently have with that area of the project but rather proposes a flood wall, which mimics that privacy wall. Construction phasing and staging plans will be part of the ongoing dialogue with the community as design progresses throughout 2023 and into early 2024. Though construction will require partial and/or full closures of certain public spaces in Battery Park City for specific periods during construction, we will endeavor to limit these closures to the extent feasible and will communicate those impacts promptly and clearly, in advance of the closures.	Public Realm
Large Format Table	Wouldn't it be more efficient to just close off the harbor?	The Federal Government has studied this and fomred its own opinion. BPCA has no control over whether a project of that magnitude, which might take multiple decades to implement, can go forward.	Public Realm
Boards	Why can't everything be kept the way it is now?	The science makes clear that, due to climate change, future storms likely will be far worse than Superstorm Sandy in 2012, which resulted in 44 lives lost in New York and billions of dollars in property damage, including more than $10M to public spaces in Battery Park City alone. In response to the inescapable reality of Lower Manhattan's unique vulnerabilities to climate change, multiple New York State and New York City entities have accelerated resiliency planning efforts. BPCA is playing a critical role in providing risk reduction for Battery Park City and adjacent neighborhoods, while also tying into the larger Lower Manhattan risk reduction objectives of the Lower Manhattan Coastal Resiliency Project (LMCR). Read more about LMCR here: https://www.nyc.gov/site/lmcr/index.page	Public Realm

Large Format Table	Urstadt once proposed filling in area above current BPC and I do not want that. It's not part of BPC. Also, 9A should not be narrowed - concerned about fire trucks getting through and Citi access to loading docks. How does HRPK approve of messing with the	There are no plans to fill in the area between Battery Park City's North Esplanade and Pier 25. Any changes to West Street/Route 9A, would be coordinated with full review and approval by the City of New York and the all relevant City and State agencies. BPCA has been coordinating actively with Hudson River Park (HRPK) on its resiliency plans since 2019 when the then-standalone North Battery Park City Resiliency Project was proposed. Dialogue with HRPK will continue as the design progresses, and no work would take place within HRPK's the Park's boundaries without concurrence and agreement between HRPK and BPCA.	Safety
Boards	I want the walkway at Reach 6 left the way it is and don't want the meandering walkway – thought this was dangerous and a waste of funds.	Thank you for your input, the North/West Battery Park City Authority project team continues to refine the design in Reach 6.	Safety
Large Format Table	Please look into past sinkhole issue just off of the northern most Gateway building.	A review of available records suggests that the sinkhole was related to a leak in buried infrastructure. The flood barrier system (FBS) will be supported by foundations that extend to bedrock and should not be impacted by similar issues that might arise in the future.	Sinkhole
Boards	In 2016 or 2017, there was a sinkhole in the sidewalk outside of Gateway Plaza's north lawn. Was the team aware of this?	Information regarding the prior condition at 385 North End Avenue that was provided at the June 26, 2023 public meeting has been provided to the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team.	Sinkhole
Large Format Table	What is the phasing for construction?	Construction phasing and staging plans will be part of the ongoing dialogue with the community as design progresses throughout 2023 and into early 2024. Though construction will require partial and/or full closures of certain public spaces in Battery Park City for specific periods during construction, we will endeavor to limit these closures to the extent feasible and will communicate those impacts promptly and clearly, in advance of the closures.	Timeline
Large Format Table	How long until completion?	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project is currenlty scheduled to begin construction in 2025 and be complete in 2027.	Timeline
Large Format Table	When is 60% design?	Currently, 60% design will is scheuled for the first half of 2024. There will be additional community outreach prior to release of the 60% designs.	Timeline
Large Format Table	Please don't remove the trees at Rockefeller Park.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is working to minimize tree removal to the greatest extent possible. In Rockefeller Park, the trees on the lawn will be minimally impacted. However, trees along the flood barrier system will need to be removed due to the required FEMA offsets from the flood wall. The project team is prioritizing replanting trees in this area and carefully considering the tree species appropriate for the climate, conditions, and biodiversity targets of the project.	Trees
Large Format Table	Which trees will be left at Rockefeller Park.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is working to minimize tree removal to the greatest extent possible. In Rockefeller Park, the trees on the lawn will be minimally impacted.	Trees
Large Format Table	So distressed about what is going to happen here. Appreciate the information, but the dust and noise and destruction of 40 year old trees. Doesn't make sense that you would destroy habitats.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team appreciates and understands the importance of mature trees as part of the landscape in BPC. To the greatest extent possible, the design team will look to increase tree canopy across the alignment.	Trees
Boards	Are any of the trees at Rockefeller Park being removed?	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is working to minimize tree removal to the greatest extent possible. In Rockefeller Park, the trees on the lawn will be minimally impacted.	Trees
Boards	Do not like the idea of the water feature as shown in North Cove.	Thank you for your input, the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team continues to refine the design of the North Cove Marina area.	View

Board & Map Comments by Reach (pp 14-16)

Reach	Comments	Response	Topics
	South side of N Moore is very busy.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team will work with the proper agencies and entities to maximize sidewalk and pedestrian clearance.	Circulation
Reach 1: N. Moore Street	Wider sidewalks for pedestrians on south side if necessary to narrow street.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team will work with the proper agencies and entities to maximize sidewalk and pedestrian clearance.	Circulation
Reach 2: North Esplanade	Ideally at least as wide, if not wider, than existing path – mixed use creates congestion, curves will exacerbate this.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is studying crossings in high pedestrian and cyclist areas in order to ensure safety of surfaces for crossing.	Circulation
Reach 6: Rector Place-Albany Street	Meandering walkway is a waste of funds that does not aid flood protection.	The meandering walkways do provide additional wave attenuation, but were originally designed to avoid the critical root zones of large, existing trees. Nonetheless, the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team acknowledges this comment and will explore adjusting the path while also working within existing design constraints.	Circulation
Reach 1	Do not want to narrow streets	The design option that narrows N. Moore St. is not being continued into further design phases.	Circulation
Reach 1	Loading dock for Citi Building, tractor trailer daily access	Thank you for this suggestion. The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team has noted this use for design consideration.	Circulation
Reach 6	Sinkhole @ 2017 385 North Corner	Information regarding the prior condition at 385 North End Avenue that was provided at the June 26, 2023 public meeting has been provided to the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team.	Existing Conditions
Reach 3: Playground View From Street	A 4.75' wall on a residential street is too high. Why not retractable between Murray & Pond?	While efforts are being made to minimize the visual impacts of the flood barrier system, a competing design criteria is to minimize the amount of active elements in the system that require closure during a storm surge event.	Flood Barrier System
Reach 4	No child can see over this wall. Why not further inland?	The alignment of the flood barrier system (FBS) is being placed as far inland as possible while still protecting BPC real estate, minimizing the length of the system, and maintaining community movement patterns.	Flood Barrier System
Reach 3: Rockefeller Park	Why is the playground equipment being replaced? (Can it be repurposed?)	The playground area will be impacted by the work in Rockefeller Park to create the flood barrier system (FBS). The possibility of repurposing existing playground equipment when the playground is reopened is being explored.	Playground

Reach 1	Don't feel there has been communication to Independence Plaza	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team has been actively coordinating with Independence Plaza, its tenant's association, and other property interests.	Public Engagement
Reach 2: Hudson River Park	Remove fence and use grates as per pier/ferry.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team continues to refine the project design.	Public Realm
Reach 5: Waterfront Plaza	Pavers that absorb water instead of seasonal water feature.	Resiliency and drainage are ongoing areas of design and exploration. While permeable pavers may not be feasible on a platform installation, the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team continues to research strategies to increase on site water capture.	Public Realm
Reach 5: Belvedere Plaza	None of the seating has had back support so it would be hard for most to linger too long or read a book. Consider some back support.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team notes this comment and will explore opportunities to provide backed seating.	Public Realm
Reach 5: South Dining Terrace	Keep same aesthetic now - want same feel as it currently feels now - don't want what was there.	Thank you for this feedback. The Battery Park City aesthetic will be considered in the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency Project design, which integrates flood protection while providing more seating, planting, and shade opportunities.	Public Realm
Reach 5: South Dining Terrace	Don't decrease lighting - increase if possible.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is currently exploring lighting opportunities for all project areas. The lighting scheme will continue to meet all code requirements as established by the City of New York.	Public Realm
Reach 6: South Corner	Aesthetics: Can we do more? Squares, urban farm, education elements not uniform	Thank you for this suggestion. The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team design team will explore these opportunities with Reach 6.	Public Realm
Reach 6: South Corner	Pick a spot that doesn't focus on planting and is focused on education -- history, geography, planting	Thank you for this suggestion. The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team will explore the potential for educational opportunities within Reach 6.	Public Realm
Reach 1	Independence Plaza: doesn't feel like it is part of BPCA.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team has been actively coordinating with Independence Plaza, its tenant's association, and other property interests.	Public Realm
Reach 7: View Along Ramp to Esplanade	3rd Pl Resident noted greenery/sculpture "attractiveness" of the neighborhood might be impacted. Views, like deployables.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team notes this comment and working to minimize to the extent possible impacts to planting and art elements on site.	Public Realm; Flood Barrier System
Reach 2: Hudson River Park	The number of trees is highly reduced in rendering.	To the greatest extent possible and where appropriate, the North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team will look to increase tree canopy across the alignment.	Trees

Reach 2: North Esplanade	Concern: fewer trees in rendering.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is working to minimize tree removal to the greatest extent possible. In Rockefeller Park, the trees on the lawn will be minimally impacted. However, trees along the flood barrier system will need to be removed due to the required FEMA offsets from the flood wall. The project team is prioritizing replanting trees in this area and carefully considering the tree species appropriate for the climate, conditions, and biodiversity targets of the project.	Trees
Reach 6: Esplanade	Pleasantly surprised that most views are measured.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team thanks you and appreciates the positive feedback.	Views
Reach 6: Rector Place-Albany Street	It would be helpful to have views from outside buildings.	The North/West Battery Park City Resiliency project team is currently evaluating and working to minimize current view sheds along the project alignment. Fly-through visuals and renderings will also continue to be updated as the project's designs are updated.	Views